Comparative Analysis of Teaching Methods Effect Based on Result-based, Process-based and Genre-based Approaches of Writing Skill amongst Intermediate English Learners

Zahra Talebi¹, Nader Assadi²*, Haniyeh Davatgari³

1. Ph.D. Candidate in English Language Teaching, Azad University of Ahar, Iran.
2. Assistant Professor of English Language Teaching, Azad University of Ahar, Iran.
3. Assistant Professor of English Language Teaching, Azad University of Ahar, Iran.

Received: 03/01/2018 Accepted: 12/03/2018

Introduction

One of the most controversial issues in applied linguistics since the past two decades concerns the role of genre-based writing instruction and its applications in the area of second language (L2) teaching and learning (Correa & Echeverri, 2017; Derewianka, 2015; Lin, 2016; Tardy, 2005, 2006, 2009, 2011; Truscott, 2012; Thompson, 2014). Genre has been variously defined by different scholars in the field of second language acquisition. Swales (1990) introduced genre as a class of “communicative events” characterized by a sequence of segments with each move accomplishing some part of the overall communicative purpose of the text, in order to produce distinctive structural patterns. The main theoretical background of the study lies on Halliday’s (1994) Systemic Functional Linguistics (SFL), which offers the most theoretically sophisticated and pedagogically developed approach of the three, underpinned by a highly evolved and insightful theory of language and motivated by a commitment to language and literacy education (Hyland, 2004; Paltridge, 2001). Paltridge (2002) concluded that writing genre-based tasks, help learners achieve some genre knowledge and develop their awareness to reflect on the acquisition of the genres they need. Although previous studies have contributed to different aspects of language pedagogy in L2 writing, much remains to be investigated regarding the impact of genre-based approach on EFL learners’ written production. Bearing the gap in the literature in mind, specifically, investigation of genre-based instruction could contribute to SLA literature theoretically and practically.

This study aims at addressing the following research questions

RQ1: Are product, process, and genre-based approaches differentially effective in the improvement of accuracy in writing among intermediate EFL learners?

RQ2: Are product, process, and genre-based approaches differentially effective in the improvement of fluency in writing among intermediate EFL learners?

*Corresponding Author: E-mail: naderasadi@yahoo.com
RQ3: Are product, process, and genre-based approaches differentially effective in the improvement of complexity in writing among intermediate EFL learners?

One-way ANOVA was employed as the statistical means of analysis for comparing the means of accuracy of product, process, and genre groups in written task.

Discussion

The main purpose of the present study was to investigate the effect of three modes of developments (product, process, and genre-based) on written task performance across linguistic domain of accuracy, fluency, and complexity in EFL context. The results of the study are in line with the findings of Swales (1986), Martin (2009), Martin & Rose (2008), Johns (2003), Hyland (2007), and Kuhi (2014) who supported the effectiveness and merits of genre-based approach on learners’ written performance. Similarly, in line with the findings of the study the results of the study conducted by Paltridge (2001) revealed that learners outperformed and produced coherent writing in the genres taught, relying on the model texts provided. Also, Yayli (2011) observed a group of EFL learners. He proposed that the students displayed awareness of generic features and applied such knowledge to the practice of genres. Similar findings were reported by Huang (2014), he found that the student developed knowledge of the research article genre through assimilating explicit genre instruction. Yayli (2011) and Huang (2014) both confirmed that genre-based pedagogy could effectively foster students’ genre awareness. In line with this arguments, Yasuda (2011) focused on a task-based syllabus design and investigated its effect in a genre-focused writing. Yasuda’s (2011) study demonstrated the effectiveness of a task-based instructional framework in genre learning. Also, Cheng (2008a) revealed that, a key finding was that the concept of genre functioned as an explicit and supportive learning tool in the student’s growing awareness.

However, the findings ran against Freedman & Richardson (1997) that centered on the disjuncture between the claim that meaning is encapsulated in textual objects, genres as autonomous systems, and the avowal of a social constructionist functional model of language. Also, Dovey (2010) conducted a design-based research and the results obtained revealed that students who learned with the process-based curriculum design had better performance in writing than their counterparts in genre group. According to Byram (2004) genre underestimates the skills required to produce content, and learners’ self-sufficiency. Similarly, Bawarshi (2000), and Badger & White (2000), adopted an approach as a synthesis of the three approaches which could lead to important development in the writing classroom. As Badger and White argue, effective communication involves knowledge about language, knowledge of the context in which the writing happens and especially the purpose for the writing (as in genre approaches), and skills in using language (as in process approaches) (2000, pp. 157-158).

Keywords: Result–based; Process-based; Genre-based; Writing Skill.